

# Technical Memorandum Comments on Appendix A of the Final Screening Level Ecological Risk Assessment Gulfco Marine Maintenance Superfund Site Freeport, Texas March 10, 2010

Remedial Action Contract 2 Full Service Contract: EP-W-06-004 Task Order: 0006-RSBD-06JZ

Prepared for

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region 6 1445 Ross Avenue Dallas, Texas 75202-2733

Prepared by

EA Engineering, Science, and Technology, Inc. 405 S. Highway 121 Building C, Suite 100 Lewisville, Texas 75067 (972) 315-3922

> April 2010 Revision: 00 EA Project No. 14342.06

9161007



Page 1 of 2 April 2010

# 1.0 INTRODUCTION

This Technical Memorandum summarizes EA Engineering, Science, and Technology, Inc.'s technical review comments for Appendix A of the Final Screening Level Ecological Risk Assessment (SLERA) prepared by Pastor, Behling & Wheeler, LLC (PBW) for the Gulfco Marine Maintenance Superfund Site (site), located in Freeport, Texas, and submitted to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) on 10 March 2010. The technical review was conducted to evaluate ProUCL data output provided in Appendix A of the SLERA to assure that this data was accurately generated, complies with guidance, and appropriate conclusions were reached.

Technical review comments pertaining to the evaluation of the ProUCL data are provided in Section 2.0. Section 3.0 provides a summary based on the outcome of the technical review.

# 2.0 TECHNICAL REVIEW COMMENTS

The evaluation indicates the ProUCL model was not run correctly, and the output results likely resulted in erroneous Upper Confidence Limits of the Means (UCLMs). Specifically, the ProUCL model was run with the assumption that data had nonparametric or normal statistical distributions, but ignored the consideration of other distributions (e.g., lognormal or gamma). Although the model output directed the user to examine other distributions, these were not assessed, and conservative assumptions were generally assumed. This error can be easily corrected by running the ProUCL software using all available statistical distributions.

As an example, Attachment 1 (taken from Appendix A of the SLERA) illustrates the model output for background barium in surface soil. The model output states "Data follow Appr. Gamma Distribution (0.05); May want to try Gamma UCLs". Pastor, Behling & Wheeler ignored this recommendation and used the nonparametric 97.5 % Chebyshev (Mean, Sd) UCLM of 902 mg/kg.

Attachment 2 illustrates the ProUCL Version 4.00.04 run for the same data allowing the examination of all statistical distributions, which duplicates the nonparametric 97.5 % Chebyshev (Mean, Sd) UCL of 902 mg/kg. As noted as part of this output, it states "Potential UCL to Use: Use 95% Approximate Gamma UCL" at 501 mg/kg. Based on this comparison, when the appropriate distribution is applied, the UCL should have been 501 mg/kg, and not 902 mg/kg.

It is expected that some of the data in all of the ProUCL model runs are actually nonparametric, in which case the proper UCLM has been chosen. However, it is likely that many of UCLMs based on the ProUCL runs shown in Appendix A may be in error because they are based on the wrong distribution.

Page 2 of 2 April 2010

# 3.0 SUMMARY

In summary, all available distribution options should have been included in the ProUCL runs shown in Appendix A, and the assumption of nonparametric or normal statistical distributions is not correct.

The use of nonparametric or normal statistics may result in conservative estimates of the Upper Confidence Limit of the Mean (refer to barium example referred to above). Consequently the SLERA conclusions are conservative. It is not necessary to rerun ProUCL for the SLERA. However, the ProUCL program must be used appropriately to select the proper distribution and UCLMs in the Baseline Ecological Risk Assessment (BERA).

99% KM (Chebyshev) UCL

8.477

730.2

1239

**1966 902** 

# Data appear Normal (0.05) May want to try Normal UCLs

# Attachment 1: ProUCL Data Output from Gulfco Marine Maintenance Site Final SLERA (Appendix A)

### Bariun

Number of Valid Observations	. 10
Number of Distinct Observations	8
Minimum	150
Maximum	1130
Mean	333.1
Median	259
SD	288.1
Variance	82980
Coefficient of Variation	0.865
Skewness	2.844
Mean of log data	5.617
SD of log data	0.571
•	
95% Useful UCLs	
Student's-t UCL	500.1
95% UCLs (Adjusted for Skewness)	
95% Adjusted-CLT UCL	570.5
95% Modified-t UCL	513.7
Non-Parametric UCLs	
95% CLT UCL	482.9
95% Jackknife UCL	500.1
95% Standard Bootstrap UCL	476.8
95% Bootstrap-t UCL	864.1
95% Hall's Bootstrap UCL	1100
95% Percentile Bootstrap UCL	497.6
95% BCÁ Bootstrap UCL	584.8

Output provided in Appendix A is limited to non-parametric statistics

Data follow Appr. Gamma Distribution (0.05)
May want to try Gamma UCLs

95% Chebyshev(Mean, Sd) UCL 97.5% Chebyshev(Mean, Sd) UCL

99% Chebyshev(Mean, Sd) UCL

Note: Program refers to gamma distribution; the same distribution found as part of the data evaluation.

# Benzo(a)anthracene

Total Number of Data	10
Number of Non-Detect Data	9
Number of Detected Data	1
Minimum Detected	0.082
Maximum Detected	0.082
Percent Non-Detects	90.00%

User Selected Options	eneral UCL Statistics		The state of the s	AND TO THE PROPERTY OF THE PRO	
	/orkSheet_a.wst		Attachment .	2: Data Evaluati	on
iiiiiii	FF'				0,,
Confidence Coefficient 9	5%	(4-1-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-2-	Rι	ın Using	ŀ
lumber of Bootstrap Operations 2	000		ProUCL V	ersion 4.00.04	-
by page second and the maximised a last published by the maximise account of the position and	its yes, thereties, . At a minimum about its times 4 years specialists	Later 11 to convenience			}
at is propresentational reason to agree much the equation of the enterior of the enterior that participate rather	an trans properties consistent between completeness between accounty to provide		(all stati	stical options)	ĺ
arium					
anguarana anti-bener stational anguarana antiquanta static antiquanta antiquanta antiquanta antiquanta antiqua	anced and the second beautiff to be second the second seco	Gener	al Statistics		
Number	of Valid Observations	10	(C) professiona a natural minimum, neggy a propriessional minimum del marine, e su receptor anti- professional	Number of Distinct Observations	10
against the contract of the property of the contract of the co		14 - 144 / 1844   1444   1444   1444   1444   1444   1444   1444   1444   1444   1444   1444   1444   1444   1	ggengdryfferen y ga'n de ffiligegaa thaanne de farmennementet 1907 de gegenneen beleikte ffilme	CHAING BERNAND MENNANDERS AND AND PARK X & POINTER B. S. AND MANY PROBLEMS, MY 12 TOWNS ATTOM COMP. SAME	
Raw Stat	istics		Log	g-transformed Statistics	
Special and the state of the st	Minimum	117		Minimum of Log Data	4.762
A manuse of the construction of the constructi	Maximum	1130		Maximum of Log Data	7.03
Improve Milli the Season Seaso	Mean	323		Mean of log Data	5.56
adaparaka 1880 il Mangorisanonom, ki y mika 1860 ilijin il 18 kilili sapak pa kilililisinda dipokoda kan	Median	238.5	MINISTER AND THE THE THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPE	SD of log Data	0.62
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	SD	293.3		at the cause come of the commentation and the same was the same and the company	
C	oefficient of Variation	0.90 2.78		anger and a graduate of the summer and an extension of a graduate of the summer and a summer and a state of the	,
Стану на настину на раз в таки да с се стр. 132 запа таконого западания изтания	Skewness	۷./۵۱	O	MATERIAL STATE OF THE STATE OF	
wite - territe regular tre Belle 8 and 8 s'Henfild, Blitte, denne Verson grav ene tipeth designeterations regula		Relevant	UCL Statistics	annes tamene no la constituira e a riba, e se e e totale a un cumo Manca anno esta casa cum	general figure 1 de participações
Normal Distrib	oution Test		Log	normal Distribution Test	
Shap	iro Wilk Test Statistic	0.61	5	Shapiro Wilk Test Statistic	0.88
Shap	iro Wilk Critical Value	0.84	2	Shapiro Wilk Critical Value	0.84
Data not Normal at 5%	Significance Level	_	Data appear L	ognormal at 5% Significance Leve	1
Assuming Norma	al Distribution	ellerthall a timbe, pendeam	Assun	ning Lognormal Distribution	og - <del>175000</del> 0014555000000 og og og
	95% Student's-t UCL	493	to realize and analyze and analyze and the second section of the section of the second section of the section of	95% H-UCL	516.9
95% UCLs (Adjuste	ed for Skewness)		CHARLES CONTROL STATEMENT OF THE CHARLES OF THE CHA	95% Chebyshev (MVUE) UCL	578
95	% Adjusted-CLT UCL	562.9	97.5% Chebyshev (MVUE) UCL 69		694.8
garaganan kanala pang hija makangga panggangan panggangan mendadan disang di danggara di dang di dipengan a ba Banggaragan	95% Modified-t UCL	506.6		99% Chebyshev (MVUE) UCL	924.2
Gamma Distrib	oution Test		anning of the state of the stat	Data Distribution	
in some seminare in agrammant in international production of the management of the contract of	star (bias corrected)	1.78	2 Data Follow Appr. Ga	mma Distribution at 5% Significan	ce Leve
is appropriate members equipment and a second and experience of the contract o	Theta Star	181.2	Abendagg ( ) (2-1-1-1-1) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) (	er cortige, commente to to to commence correctly comment of contribution to the conference of the conf	or <sup>a</sup> Charles billions and I 1997 gra
ones en la relaçõesce cambre a sum esta en ambre sum esta en actual de sum esta en en entre en entre en entre en entre en entre en entre en en entre entre en entre entre en entre en	MLE of Mean	323	104 mlng and a common to 105 to	•	
MLE (	of Standard Deviation	241.9	Omethy (district principle)		
, and it is sometimes that it was approximated the state that the source of many of the source of th	nu star	35.65		od kalika grapijanska va va kalika kun saka grapijanska kalika kula kalika yana saka kasa kalika kalika kalika	
	hi Square Value (.05)	22.99	and the same and t	onparametric Statistics	<b>-</b> ,115 <b>-</b> , <b>2</b> (10)
	Level of Significance	0.026	ii, par e far managamanana	95% CLT UCL	475.5
Adjus	ted Chi Square Value	21.23	in transmission in a property of the state o	95% Jackknife UCL	493
galory gal de gyalong gyllyngo (H) ( gygygyriga (yr a by Yessynnon annallys gynnaullifan hillyngadonskil i haysagir				95% Standard Bootstrap UCL	465
advantad to the contract of th	Darling Test Statistic	0.82	annual section 12	95% Bootstrap-t UCL 95% Hall's Bootstrap UCL	819.2 1092
toracci su circo processaçõe de arragonação de las chaque e e constitue do medico de a finación, estre deser faces d	ing 5% Critical Value	0.73		95% Percentile Bootstrap UCL	494.2
	Smirnov Test Statistic	0.24	etatietice	95% BCA Bootstrap UCL	536.8
	new arm callical Valide).	0.20	ו: כ	SO NO DOM DOUGHAP OUL)	000.0
Nolmogorov-Smiri Data follow Appr. Gamma Distribu		contra commentation of		95% Chehvshev(Mean, Sd) UCL	727.3

95% Approximate Gamma UCL	500.9	Sudinish adalah dalam santungkerin inan usida standaranga danaharang dari barandaran santung ang bisan santung I I	
95% Adjusted Gamma UCL	542.3		
Potential UCL to Use	name and and the name of	Use 95% Approximate Gamm	a UCL 500.9
		·	
		Chosen UCL	

•

.

5